



SECOND VARIATION OF F -EINSTEIN-HILBERT FUNCTIONAL

AHMED MOHAMMED CHERIF  *

Abstract. This article describes a formula for second variation of generalized Einstein-Hilbert functional on Riemannian manifolds. This work extends the definition of stable Einstein manifolds, and we present some properties.

Keywords: Einstein manifolds, Einstein-Hilbert functional.

2020 Mathematics Subject Classification: Primary 53C25, Secondary 83C05.

1. INTRODUCTION

The Einstein-Hilbert functional \mathcal{E} associates to each Riemannian metric g the integral of its scalar curvature S , that is

$$\mathcal{E} : \mathcal{M} \longrightarrow \mathbb{R}, \quad g \longmapsto \mathcal{E}(g) = \int_M S v^g, \tag{1.1}$$

where \mathcal{M} is the set of smooth Riemannian metrics on M , and v^g the volume form with respect to g . It is the action functional that defines the dynamics of gravity in general relativity [3, 4, 5, 6, 8, 16].

One of the simplest modifications to general relativity is the $F(S)$ gravity in which the Lagrangian density F is an arbitrary smooth function of the scalar curvature S of a Riemannian manifold (M, g) . When $F(s) = s$, gives the classical Einstein-Hilbert functional, therefore the Einstein gravity, corresponds to $F(S) = S$. The Euler-Lagrange equation of the generalized Einstein-Hilbert functional (it is known by Einstein-Hilbert functional in $f(R)$ gravity, or briefly F -Einstein-Hilbert functional) with respect to g is proved by A. D. Felice, S. Tsujikawa in [7], and T. P. Sotiriou, V. Faraoni in [17].

The second variation of Einstein-Hilbert functional at Einstein metrics was considered in [11]. In [9], K. Kröncke study the second variation of the Einstein-Hilbert functional on Einstein metrics, he find some conditions for stability of Einstein manifolds with respect to the Einstein-Hilbert functional, i.e., that the second variation of the Einstein-Hilbert functional at the metric is nonpositive in the direction of transverse-traceless tensors. Stability properties of compact Riemannian Einstein manifold play a role in mathematical general relativity [1], and in geometric analysis to understand rigidity of Riemannian structures, for example

Received: 2026.03.29

Accepted: 2026.06.02

* Corresponding author

Ahmed Mohammed Cherif \diamond a.mohammedcherif@univ-mascara.dz \diamond <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-6155-0976>

the dynamical behaviour of the Ricci flow.

In this paper, we extend the definition of the Einstein tensor, where we calculate the first variation of the F -Einstein-Hilbert functional, and we conclude the generalized Einstein tensor. We prove that the generalized Einstein tensor is divergence-free. We study the second variation of the F -Einstein-Hilbert functional on the Riemannian manifold. The second variation formula gives a tool/is a prerequisite for the study the stability of any generalized Einstein manifold, and to see if the F -Einstein-Hilbert functional has extremality properties at some critical points. The smooth function F can be chosen for the existence and the stability of such Riemannian metrics which provide additional information on Riemannian manifolds.

2. F -EINSTEIN-HILBERT FUNCTIONAL

First, we give some definitions. Let (M, g) be an n -dimensional Riemannian manifold, and let $X, X_1, \dots, X_{q-1}, Y, Z \in \Gamma(TM)$. By R , Ric and S we denote respectively the Riemannian curvature tensor, the Ricci tensor and the scalar curvature of (M, g) . Thus R , Ric and S are defined by

$$R(X, Y)Z = \nabla_X \nabla_Y Z - \nabla_Y \nabla_X Z - \nabla_{[X, Y]} Z, \tag{2.2}$$

$$\text{Ric}(X, Y) = g(R(X, e_i)e_i, Y), \quad S = \text{Ric}(e_i, e_i), \tag{2.3}$$

where ∇ is the Levi-Civita connection with respect to g , $\{e_1, \dots, e_n\}$ is an orthonormal frame. Given a smooth function f on M , the gradient of f is defined by

$$g(\text{grad } f, X) = X(f), \tag{2.4}$$

the Hessian of f is defined by

$$(\text{Hess } f)(X, Y) = g(\nabla_X \text{grad } f, Y), \tag{2.5}$$

the Laplacian of f is defined by

$$\Delta f = -\text{Tr}(\text{Hess } f). \tag{2.6}$$

The divergence of $(0, q)$ -tensor α on M is defined by

$$(\delta\alpha)(X_1, \dots, X_{q-1}) = -(\nabla_{e_i}\alpha)(e_i, X_1, \dots, X_{q-1}). \tag{2.7}$$

The formal adjoint of the divergence $\delta : \Gamma(\otimes^2 T^*M) \longrightarrow \Gamma(T^*M)$ is the map $\delta^* : \Gamma(T^*M) \longrightarrow \Gamma(\otimes^2 T^*M)$ defined by

$$(\delta^*\alpha)(X, Y) = \frac{1}{2}((\nabla_X\alpha)Y + (\nabla_Y\alpha)X). \tag{2.8}$$

The formal adjoint of the Levi-civita connection ∇ is given by

$$(\nabla^*\alpha)(X_1, \dots, X_{q-1}) = -(\nabla_{e_i}\alpha)(e_i, X_1, \dots, X_{q-1}), \tag{2.9}$$

where $\alpha \in \Gamma(T^*M \otimes T^{(p,q)}M)$, and $\{e_1, \dots, e_n\}$ is an orthonormal frame.

The composition of $T, Q \in \Gamma(\odot^2 T^*M)$ is defined by

$$(T \circ Q)(X, Y) = T(X, e_i)Q(Y, e_i), \tag{2.10}$$

where $\{e_1, \dots, e_n\}$ is an orthonormal frame on M .

For $T \in \Gamma(\otimes^2 T^*M)$, we define $T^\sigma \in \Gamma(\odot^2 T^*M)$ by

$$T^\sigma(X, Y) = \frac{1}{2}(T(X, Y) + T(Y, X)). \quad (2.11)$$

We define an endomorphism $\overset{\circ}{R} : \Gamma(\odot^2 T^*M) \longrightarrow \Gamma(\odot^2 T^*M)$ by

$$(\overset{\circ}{R}T)(X, Y) = T(R(e_i, X)Y, e_i). \quad (2.12)$$

For $T \in \Gamma(\odot^2 T^*M)$, we define the Lichnerowicz Laplacian by

$$\Delta_L T = \nabla^* \nabla T + \text{Ric} \circ T + T \circ \text{Ric} - 2\overset{\circ}{R}T. \quad (2.13)$$

(For more details, see for example [4], [15]).

Definition 2.1 ([7], [17]). *We let \mathcal{M} denote the space of Riemannian metrics on a closed orientable manifold M . The generalized Einstein-Hilbert functional (or F -Einstein-Hilbert functional) is defined by*

$$\mathcal{E}_F : \mathcal{M} \longrightarrow \mathbb{R}, \quad g \longmapsto \mathcal{E}_F(g) = \int_M F(S)v^g, \quad (2.14)$$

where S is the scalar curvature of (M, g) , and $F : \mathbb{R} \longrightarrow \mathbb{R}$ is a non-constant smooth function.

The Definition 2.1, is a natural generalization of Einstein-Hilbert functional or the total scalar curvature, when F is the identity map, then \mathcal{E}_F reduces to the usual Einstein-Hilbert functional whose second order infinitesimal behaviour is well understood (see [3, 4, 5, 6, 8, 10, 11, 12, 13, 16]).

Let (M, g) be a closed orientable Riemannian manifold. Consider a smooth one-parameter variation of the metric g , i.e., a smooth family of metrics (g_t) with $-\epsilon < t < \epsilon$, such that $g_0 = g$. Take local coordinates (x^i) on M , and write the metric on M in the usual way as $g_t = g_{i,j}(t, x)dx^i \otimes dx^j$. Write $h = (\partial g_t / \partial t)_{t=0}$, then $h \in \Gamma(\odot^2 T^*M)$ is a symmetric 2-covariant tensor field on M , we get the following.

Theorem 2.1 ([7], [17]). *The first variation of the F -Einstein-Hilbert functional in the direction of h is given by the formula*

$$\left. \frac{d}{dt} \mathcal{E}_F(g_t) \right|_{t=0} = - \int_M \langle E_F(g), h \rangle v^g, \quad (2.15)$$

where \langle, \rangle is the induced Riemannian metric on $\odot^2 T^*M$,

$$E_F(g) = F'(S) \text{Ric} - \text{Hess } F'(S) - (\Delta F'(S) + \frac{1}{2} F'(S))g, \quad (2.16)$$

and F' is the derivative of the function F .

Definition 2.2. $E_F(g)$ is called the generalized Einstein tensor (or F -Einstein tensor).

For the proof of Theorem 2.1, we need the following lemma.

Lemma 2.1 ([14], [18]). *Let (M, g) be a Riemannian manifold. Then, the differential at g , in the direction of h , of the volume element and the scalar curvature are given by the following formulas*

$$\left. \frac{\partial v^{g_t}}{\partial t} \right|_{t=0} = \frac{1}{2}(\text{Tr } h)v^g = \frac{1}{2}\langle g, h \rangle v^g, \quad (2.17)$$

$$\frac{\partial S_t}{\partial t} \Big|_{t=0} = \Delta(\text{Tr } h) + \delta(\delta h) - \langle \text{Ric}, h \rangle. \tag{2.18}$$

Proof of Theorem 2.1. First note that

$$\frac{d}{dt} \mathcal{E}_F(g_t) \Big|_{t=0} = \int_M \left[\frac{\partial F(S_t)}{\partial t} v^{g_t} + F(S_t) \frac{\partial v^{g_t}}{\partial t} \right]_{t=0}, \tag{2.19}$$

for all $t \in (-\epsilon, \epsilon)$, we have

$$\frac{\partial F(S_t)}{\partial t} = F'(S_t) \frac{\partial S_t}{\partial t},$$

by the Lemma 2.1, we obtain

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\partial F(S_t)}{\partial t} \Big|_{t=0} &= F'(S) \Delta(\text{Tr } h) + F'(S) \delta(\delta h) \\ &\quad - F'(S) \langle \text{Ric}, h \rangle. \end{aligned} \tag{2.20}$$

Calculating in a normal frame at $x \in M$ we have

$$\begin{aligned} F'(S) \Delta(\text{Tr } h) &= -F'(S) e_i(e_i(\text{Tr } h)) \\ &= -e_i(F'(S) e_i(\text{Tr } h)) + e_i(F'(S)) e_i(\text{Tr } h) \\ &= -e_i(F'(S) e_i(\text{Tr } h)) + e_i(e_i(F'(S)) \text{Tr } h) \\ &\quad - e_i(e_i(F'(S))) \text{Tr } h, \end{aligned} \tag{2.21}$$

so, the first term in the right-hand side of (2.20), is given by

$$\begin{aligned} F'(S) \Delta(\text{Tr } h) &= \delta(F'(S) d(\text{Tr } h)) - \delta((\text{Tr } h) dF'(S)) \\ &\quad + \Delta(F'(S)) \langle g, h \rangle. \end{aligned} \tag{2.22}$$

If $f \in C^\infty(M)$ and $\alpha \in \Gamma(T^*M)$, then (see [18], [15])

$$\delta(f\alpha) = -\langle df, \alpha \rangle + f\delta\alpha, \tag{2.23}$$

with $\langle df, \alpha \rangle = \alpha(\text{grad } f)$. Applying this formula, gives

$$F'(S) \delta(\delta h) = \delta(F'(S) \delta h) + \langle dF'(S), \delta h \rangle, \tag{2.24}$$

by using the following formula (see [18])

$$(\delta T)(Z) = \delta(T(\cdot, Z)) + \frac{1}{2} \langle T, \mathcal{L}_Z g \rangle, \tag{2.25}$$

where $\mathcal{L}_Z g$ is the Lie-derivative of g along $Z \in \Gamma(TM)$ (see [15]), and $T \in \Gamma(\odot^2 T^*M)$, we get

$$\begin{aligned} \langle dF'(S), \delta h \rangle &= (\delta h)(\text{grad } F'(S)) \\ &= \delta(h(\cdot, \text{grad } F'(S))) + \frac{1}{2} \langle h, \mathcal{L}_{\text{grad } F'(S)} g \rangle \\ &= \delta(h(\cdot, \text{grad } F'(S))) + \langle h, \text{Hess } F'(S) \rangle, \end{aligned} \tag{2.26}$$

by equations (2.24) and (2.26), the second term on the left-hand side of (2.20) is

$$\begin{aligned} F'(S) \delta(\delta h) &= \delta(F'(S) \delta h) + \delta(h(\cdot, \text{grad } F'(S))) \\ &\quad + \langle h, \text{Hess } F'(S) \rangle. \end{aligned} \tag{2.27}$$

Substituting (2.22) and (2.27) in (2.20), we obtain

$$\begin{aligned} \left. \frac{\partial F(S_t)}{\partial t} \right|_{t=0} &= \delta(F'(S)d(\text{Tr } h)) - \delta((\text{Tr } h)dF'(S)) \\ &\quad + \Delta(F'(S))\langle g, h \rangle + \delta(F'(S)\delta h) \\ &\quad + \delta(h(\cdot, \text{grad } F'(S))) + \langle h, \text{Hess } F'(S) \rangle \\ &\quad - F'(S)\langle \text{Ric}, h \rangle. \end{aligned} \quad (2.28)$$

From equation (2.28) and the Lemma 2.1, we have

$$\begin{aligned} \left[\frac{\partial F(S_t)}{\partial t} v^{gt} + F(S_t) \frac{\partial v^{gt}}{\partial t} \right]_{t=0} &= \left\{ \delta(F'(S)d(\text{Tr } h)) - \delta((\text{Tr } h)dF'(S)) \right. \\ &\quad + \Delta(F'(S))\langle g, h \rangle + \delta(F'(S)\delta h) \\ &\quad + \delta(h(\cdot, \text{grad } F'(S))) + \langle h, \text{Hess } F'(S) \rangle \\ &\quad \left. - F'(S)\langle \text{Ric}, h \rangle \right\} v^g + \frac{F(S)}{2} \langle g, h \rangle v^g. \end{aligned} \quad (2.29)$$

Substituting the formula (2.29) in (2.19), and consider the divergence theorem (see [2]), the Theorem 2.1 follows. \square

Remark 2.1. Let $X, Y \in \Gamma(TM)$, we have

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Hess } F'(S)(X, Y) &= X(Y(F'(S))) - (\nabla_X Y)(F'(S)) \\ &= X(F''(S)Y(S)) - F''(S)(\nabla_X Y)(S) \\ &= X(F''(S))Y(S) + F''(S)X(Y(S)) - F''(S)(\nabla_X Y)(S) \\ &= F'''(S)X(S)Y(S) + F''(S)(\text{Hess } S)(X, Y). \end{aligned}$$

According to this formula, the F -Einstein tensor is given by

$$\begin{aligned} E_F(g) &= F'(S) \text{Ric} - F''(S) \text{Hess } S - F'''(S) dS \otimes dS \\ &\quad - (F''(S) \Delta S + F'''(S) |\text{grad } S|^2 + \frac{1}{2} F(S)) g. \end{aligned} \quad (2.30)$$

Remark 2.2. Let (M, g) be a Riemannian manifold, we get the following

- If $F(s) = s$, for all $s \in \mathbb{R}$, the F -Einstein tensor is given by the formula (see [4], [14])

$$E_F(g) = E(g) = \text{Ric} - \frac{S}{2} g, \quad (2.31)$$

is the Einstein tensor.

- If $F(s) = s^2$, for all $s \in \mathbb{R}$, the F -Einstein tensor is given by (see [4], [5], [6])

$$E_F(g) = 2S \text{Ric} - 2 \text{Hess } S - (2\Delta S + \frac{S^2}{2}) g. \quad (2.32)$$

From Theorem 2.1, we deduce.

Theorem 2.2 ([7], [17]). A Riemannian metric g is a critical point of the F -Einstein-Hilbert functional if and only if

$$F'(S) \text{Ric} - \text{Hess } F'(S) - (\Delta F'(S) + \frac{1}{2} F(S)) g = 0, \quad (2.33)$$

where $F : \mathbb{R} \longrightarrow \mathbb{R}$ is a non-constant smooth function.

By taking traces in (2.33), we obtain

$$SF'(S) + (1 - n)\Delta F'(S) - \frac{n}{2}F(S) = 0. \tag{2.34}$$

Theorem 2.3. *Let (M, g) be a Riemannian manifold. Then, the divergence of the generalized Einstein tensor is zero (that is, $\delta E_F(g) = 0$).*

Proof. Let $F : \mathbb{R} \longrightarrow \mathbb{R}$ be a smooth function, calculating in a normal frame $\{e_i\}$ at $x \in M$, with $X = e_j$, we have

$$\delta E_F(g)(X) = -(\nabla_{e_i} E_F(g))(e_i, X) = -e_i(E_F(g)(e_i, X)), \tag{2.35}$$

by the definitions of generalized Einstein tensor, and the Hessian tensor, we get

$$\begin{aligned} E_F(g)(e_i, X) &= F'(S) \operatorname{Ric}(e_i, X) - g(\nabla_{e_i} \operatorname{grad} F'(S), X) \\ &\quad - (\Delta F'(S) + \frac{1}{2}F(S))g(e_i, X), \end{aligned} \tag{2.36}$$

substituting (2.36) in (2.35), and consider the definition of gradient operator, we obtain

$$\begin{aligned} \delta E_F(g)(X) &= -\operatorname{Ric}(\operatorname{grad} F'(S), X) - F'(S)e_i(\operatorname{Ric}(e_i, X)) \\ &\quad + g(\nabla_{e_i} \nabla_X \operatorname{grad} F'(S), e_i) + X(\Delta F'(S)) + \frac{1}{2}X(F(S)), \end{aligned}$$

by the definitions of the divergence, and the curvature tensor, with $[e_i, X] = 0$, we conclude that

$$\begin{aligned} \delta E_F(g)(X) &= -\operatorname{Ric}(\operatorname{grad} F'(S), X) + F'(S)(\delta \operatorname{Ric})(X) \\ &\quad + g(R(e_i, X) \operatorname{grad} F'(S), e_i) + g(\nabla_X \nabla_{e_i} \operatorname{grad} F'(S), e_i) \\ &\quad + X(\Delta F'(S)) + \frac{1}{2}X(F(S)), \end{aligned} \tag{2.37}$$

note that

$$\operatorname{Ric}(\operatorname{grad} F'(S), X) = g(R(e_i, X) \operatorname{grad} F'(S), e_i), \tag{2.38}$$

$$F'(S)(\delta \operatorname{Ric})(X) = -\frac{1}{2}X(F(S)) = -\frac{1}{2}F'(S)X(S), \tag{2.39}$$

$$g(\nabla_X \nabla_{e_i} \operatorname{grad} F'(S), e_i) = -X(\Delta F'(S)). \tag{2.40}$$

Substituting the formulas (2.38), (2.39) and (2.40) in (2.37), the Theorem 2.3 follows. \square

Remark 2.3.

- If $E_F(g) = fg$ for some function f on M , then f is constant function on M (because $\delta E_F(g) = 0$).
- The condition $E_F(g) = \lambda g$ is equivalent to

$$F'(S) \operatorname{Ric} - \operatorname{Hess} F'(S) = \mu g, \tag{2.41}$$

for some function μ on M , it is also equivalent to

$$F'(S) \operatorname{Ric} - F''(S) \operatorname{Hess} S - F'''(S)dS \otimes dS = \mu g, \tag{2.42}$$

(see equation (2.30)).

- If $F(s) = s$, for all $s \in \mathbb{R}$, then $E_F(g) = \lambda g$ if (M, g) is Einstein manifold, that is $\text{Ric} = \mu g$ for some constant μ (see [4]).

Example 2.1. Let $M = (0, \infty) \times \mathbb{R}^3$ equipped with the Riemannian metric $g = dt^2 + t^2(dx^2 + dy^2 + dz^2)$. Let $F(s) = s^\alpha$ for some constant α . Then, $E_F(g) = 0$ if and only if $\alpha = \frac{1 \pm \sqrt{3}}{2}$.

Example 2.2. Let $M = \mathbb{S}^n \subset \mathbb{R}^{n+1}$ and $F : \mathbb{R} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ a non-constant smooth function. Then, the induced Riemannian metric $g^{\mathbb{S}^n}$ is a critical point of the F -Einstein-Hilbert functional if and only if $F(s_0) = 0$ and $F'(s_0) = 0$ where $s_0 = n(n-1)$ is the scalar curvature of $(\mathbb{S}^n, g^{\mathbb{S}^n})$.

Remark 2.4. The previous examples prove the following results; There is no equivalence between $E_F(g) = 0$ and $E(g) = 0$ where F is a non-constant smooth function. There exist Riemannian Einstein metrics which are critical points of the F -Einstein-Hilbert functional where $F(s) \neq s$.

3. THE SECOND VARIATION OF \mathcal{E}_F

Let M be a closed orientable manifold. We denote by

$$\mathcal{M}_c = \{g \in \mathcal{M} \mid \text{Vol}(M, g) = \int_M v^g = c\},$$

for some constant $c > 0$. This is a submanifold of \mathcal{M} of codimension 1, and its tangent space at $g \in \mathcal{M}_c$ is given by

$$T_g \mathcal{M}_c = \{T \in \Gamma(\odot^2 T^* M) \mid \int_M \langle g, T \rangle v^g = 0\}.$$

A Riemannian metric g is a critical point of $\mathcal{E}_F|_{\mathcal{M}_c}$ if and only if $E_F(g)$ is orthogonal to $T_g \mathcal{M}_c$, that is $E_F(g) = \lambda g$ for some constant λ . In the following Theorem, we calculate the second derivative of $\mathcal{E}_F(g_t)$ at $t = 0$ where (g_t) ($-\epsilon < t < \epsilon$) is a smooth one-parameter variation of such Riemannian metric g which enables us to know the extremality properties of \mathcal{E}_F . Write

$$h = \left. \frac{\partial g_t}{\partial t} \right|_{t=0}, \quad k = \left. \frac{\partial^2 g_t}{\partial t^2} \right|_{t=0}, \quad (3.43)$$

then $h, k \in \Gamma(\odot^2 T^* M)$. Under the notation above we have the following.

Theorem 3.1. Let (M, g) be a closed orientable Riemannian manifold with volume c . Suppose that $E_F(g) = \lambda g$, for some constant λ , then the second variation of $\mathcal{E}_F|_{\mathcal{M}_c}$ at g in the direction of h is given by

$$\left. \frac{d^2}{dt^2} \mathcal{E}_F(g_t) \right|_{t=0} = \int_M \langle T_0(h) + T_1(h), h \rangle v^g,$$

where $T_0(h), T_1(h)$ are defined by

$$\begin{aligned} T_0(h) &= -\frac{F'(S)}{2} \nabla^* \nabla h + F'(S) \overset{\circ}{R} h + F'(S) \delta^*(\delta h) + \frac{1}{2} F'(S) \text{Hess}(\text{Tr } h) \\ &\quad + \frac{F'(S)}{2} [\Delta(\text{Tr } h) + \delta(\delta h)] g - \frac{1}{2} \left[\lambda + \frac{1}{2} F(S) \right] (\text{Tr } h) g, \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 T_1(h) &= -f \operatorname{Ric} + \operatorname{Hess} f + (\Delta f)g - h(\nabla \cdot \operatorname{grad} F'(S), \cdot)^\sigma - (\nabla \cdot h)(\cdot, \operatorname{grad} F'(S))^\sigma \\
 &\quad + \frac{1}{2} \nabla_{\operatorname{grad} F'(S)} h - \langle \delta h + \frac{1}{2} d(\operatorname{Tr} h), dF'(S) \rangle g - \frac{1}{2} (\Delta F'(S))(\operatorname{Tr} h)g \\
 &\quad + \frac{1}{2} \langle \operatorname{Hess} F'(S), h \rangle g,
 \end{aligned}$$

and $f = F''(S)[\Delta(\operatorname{Tr} h) + \delta(\delta h) - \langle \operatorname{Ric}, h \rangle]$.

For the proof of Theorem 3.1, we need the following lemmas.

Lemma 3.1. *Let $T_t, Q_t \in \Gamma(\otimes^2 T^*M)$ all dependent of time $t \in (-\epsilon, \epsilon)$ with $T_0 = T$ and $Q_0 = Q$. Then*

$$\left. \frac{\partial}{\partial t} \right|_{t=0} \langle T_t, Q_t \rangle_t = \left\langle \left. \frac{\partial T_t}{\partial t} \right|_{t=0}, Q \right\rangle + \left\langle T, \left. \frac{\partial Q_t}{\partial t} \right|_{t=0} \right\rangle - 2 \langle T, h \circ Q \rangle,$$

where $\langle \cdot, \cdot \rangle_t$ is the induced Riemannian metric (with respect to g_t) on $\otimes^2 T^*M$.

Proof. We have

$$\langle T_t, Q_t \rangle_t = T_t^{ij} Q_t^{ab} g_t^{ia} g_t^{jb},$$

so that

$$\begin{aligned}
 \left. \frac{\partial}{\partial t} \right|_{t=0} \langle T_t, Q_t \rangle_t &= \left. \frac{\partial T_t^{ij}}{\partial t} \right|_{t=0} Q^{ab} g^{ia} g^{jb} + T^{ij} \left. \frac{\partial Q_t^{ab}}{\partial t} \right|_{t=0} g^{ia} g^{jb} \\
 &\quad + T^{ij} Q^{ab} \left. \frac{\partial g_t^{ia}}{\partial t} \right|_{t=0} g^{jb} + T^{ij} Q^{ab} g^{ia} \left. \frac{\partial g_t^{jb}}{\partial t} \right|_{t=0},
 \end{aligned}$$

since $\left. \frac{\partial g_t^{ia}}{\partial t} \right|_{t=0} = -g^{iu} g^{av} h_{uv}$ and $\left. \frac{\partial g_t^{jb}}{\partial t} \right|_{t=0} = -g^{ju} g^{bv} h_{uv}$ (see [14]), we get

$$\begin{aligned}
 \left. \frac{\partial}{\partial t} \right|_{t=0} \langle T_t, Q_t \rangle_t &= \left\langle \left. \frac{\partial T_t}{\partial t} \right|_{t=0}, Q \right\rangle + \left\langle T, \left. \frac{\partial Q_t}{\partial t} \right|_{t=0} \right\rangle \\
 &\quad - T^{ij} Q^{ab} g^{iu} g^{av} h_{uv} g^{jb} - T^{ij} Q^{ab} g^{ia} g^{ju} g^{bv} h_{uv},
 \end{aligned}$$

note that

$$-T^{ij} Q^{ab} g^{iu} g^{av} h_{uv} g^{jb} - T^{ij} Q^{ab} g^{ia} g^{ju} g^{bv} h_{uv} = -2T^{ij} Q^{ab} g^{iu} g^{av} h_{uv} g^{jb},$$

on the other hand

$$\begin{aligned}
 -2 \langle T, h \circ Q \rangle &= -2T^{ij} (h \circ Q)^{ub} g^{iu} g^{jb} \\
 &= -2T^{ij} g^{av} h_{uv} Q^{ab} g^{iu} g^{jb}.
 \end{aligned}$$

□

Lemma 3.2. *Let (f_t) ($-\epsilon < t < \epsilon$) be a time dependent family of smooth functions on M with $f_0 = f$. Then, the first variation of the Hessian and the Laplacian are given by*

$$\left. \frac{\partial \operatorname{Hess}_t f_t}{\partial t} \right|_{t=0} = \operatorname{Hess} \left(\left. \frac{\partial f_t}{\partial t} \right|_{t=0} \right) - (\nabla \cdot h)(\cdot, \operatorname{grad} f)^\sigma + \frac{1}{2} \nabla_{\operatorname{grad} f} h,$$

$$\left. \frac{\partial \Delta_t f_t}{\partial t} \right|_{t=0} = \Delta \left(\left. \frac{\partial f_t}{\partial t} \right|_{t=0} \right) - \langle \delta h + \frac{1}{2} d(\operatorname{Tr} h), df \rangle + \langle \operatorname{Hess} f, h \rangle,$$

where $\operatorname{Hess}_t f_t$ (resp. $\Delta_t f_t$) is the Hessian (resp. Laplacian) of f_t with respect to the metric g_t .

Proof. By the definition of Hessian (2.5), we obtain

$$\begin{aligned}
\frac{\partial \text{Hess}_t f_t}{\partial t}(X, Y) &= \frac{\partial}{\partial t} \left[X(Y(f_t)) - (\nabla_X^t Y)(f_t) \right] \\
&= \frac{\partial}{\partial t} \left[X(Y(f_t)) - g(\nabla_X^t Y, \text{grad } f_t) \right] \\
&= X(Y(\frac{\partial f_t}{\partial t})) - g(\frac{\partial}{\partial t} \nabla_X^t Y, \text{grad } f_t) - g(\nabla_X^t Y, \text{grad } \frac{\partial f_t}{\partial t}),
\end{aligned} \tag{3.44}$$

where ∇^t is the Levi-Civita connection with respect to g_t . The first variation of the Levi-Civita connection in the direction of h is given by the formula

$$g\left(\frac{\partial}{\partial t} \nabla_X^t Y \Big|_{t=0}, Z\right) = \frac{1}{2} \left[(\nabla_X h)(Y, Z) + (\nabla_Y h)(X, Z) - (\nabla_Z h)(X, Y) \right], \tag{3.45}$$

(see [4]). Here $X, Y, Z \in \Gamma(TM)$ (all independent of time t). We conclude that

$$\frac{\partial \text{Hess}_t f_t}{\partial t} \Big|_{t=0} = \text{Hess} \left(\frac{\partial f_t}{\partial t} \Big|_{t=0} \right) - (\nabla \cdot h)(\cdot, \text{grad } f)^\sigma + \frac{1}{2} \nabla_{\text{grad } f} h. \tag{3.46}$$

By the Lemma 3.1, the first variation of $\Delta_t f_t$ is given by

$$\begin{aligned}
\frac{\partial \Delta_t f_t}{\partial t} \Big|_{t=0} &= -\frac{\partial}{\partial t} \Big|_{t=0} \langle \text{Hess}_t f_t, g_t \rangle_t \\
&= -\langle \frac{\partial}{\partial t} \text{Hess}_t f_t \Big|_{t=0}, g \rangle - \langle \text{Hess } f, h \rangle + 2\langle \text{Hess } f, h \circ g \rangle,
\end{aligned} \tag{3.47}$$

by equations (3.46), (3.47), with $h \circ g = h$, we have

$$\begin{aligned}
\frac{\partial \Delta_t f_t}{\partial t} \Big|_{t=0} &= \Delta \left(\frac{\partial f_t}{\partial t} \Big|_{t=0} \right) + \text{Tr}(\nabla \cdot h)(\cdot, \text{grad } f)^\sigma \\
&\quad - \frac{1}{2} \text{Tr} \nabla_{\text{grad } f} h + \langle \text{Hess } f, h \rangle,
\end{aligned} \tag{3.48}$$

and note that

$$\text{Tr}(\nabla \cdot h)(\cdot, \text{grad } f)^\sigma = -\langle \delta h, df \rangle, \tag{3.49}$$

$$-\frac{1}{2} \text{Tr} \nabla_{\text{grad } f} h = -\frac{1}{2} \langle d(\text{Tr } h), df \rangle. \tag{3.50}$$

The proof is completed. \square

Proof of Theorem 3.1. First note that

$$\frac{d^2}{dt^2} \mathcal{E}_F(g_t) \Big|_{t=0} = -\frac{d}{dt} \Big|_{t=0} \int_M \langle E_F(g_t), \frac{\partial g_t}{\partial t} \rangle_t v^{g_t}, \tag{3.51}$$

by the variational formulas in Lemma 3.1, we have

$$\begin{aligned}
\frac{d^2}{dt^2} \mathcal{E}_F(g_t) \Big|_{t=0} &= -\int_M \left\langle \frac{\partial}{\partial t} E_F(g_t) \Big|_{t=0}, h \right\rangle v^g \\
&\quad - \int_M \langle E_F(g), k \rangle v^g \\
&\quad + 2 \int_M \langle E_F(g), h \circ h \rangle v^g \\
&\quad - \frac{1}{2} \int_M \langle E_F(g), h \rangle (\text{Tr } h) v^g.
\end{aligned} \tag{3.52}$$

Since $E_F(g) = \lambda g$, we obtain

$$2 \int_M \langle E_F(g), h \circ h \rangle v^g = 2\lambda \int_M |h|^2 v^g, \tag{3.53}$$

$$-\frac{1}{2} \int_M \langle E_F(g), h \rangle (\text{Tr } h) v^g = -\frac{\lambda}{2} \int_M (\text{Tr } h)^2 v^g. \tag{3.54}$$

Since $\text{Vol}(M, g_t) = c$, we have

$$\frac{d^2}{dt^2} \Big|_{t=0} \text{Vol}(M, g_t) = \int_M \frac{\partial^2 v^{g_t}}{\partial t^2} \Big|_{t=0} = 0, \tag{3.55}$$

by equation (3.55), and Lemma 2.1, we get

$$\frac{1}{2} \int_M \frac{\partial}{\partial t} \Big|_{t=0} \left[(\text{Tr}_t \frac{\partial g_t}{\partial t}) v^{g_t} \right] = 0, \tag{3.56}$$

where $\text{Tr}_t \frac{\partial g_t}{\partial t}$ is the trace of $\frac{\partial g_t}{\partial t}$ with respect to g_t , from equation (3.56), and the Lemmas 2.1 and 3.1, we obtain

$$\begin{aligned} 0 &= \int_M \left[\frac{\partial}{\partial t} (\text{Tr}_t \frac{\partial g_t}{\partial t}) \Big|_{t=0} v^g + (\text{Tr } h) \frac{\partial v^{g_t}}{\partial t} \Big|_{t=0} \right] \\ &= \int_M \left[\frac{\partial}{\partial t} \langle g_t, \frac{\partial g_t}{\partial t} \rangle_t \Big|_{t=0} v^g + \frac{1}{2} (\text{Tr } h)^2 v^g \right] \\ &= \int_M \left[|h|^2 + (\text{Tr } k) - 2\langle g, h \circ h \rangle + \frac{1}{2} (\text{Tr } h)^2 \right] v^g \\ &= \int_M \left[-|h|^2 + (\text{Tr } k) + \frac{1}{2} (\text{Tr } h)^2 \right] v^g, \end{aligned} \tag{3.57}$$

by equation (3.57), the second term on the left-hand side of (3.52) is

$$\begin{aligned} - \int_M \langle E_F(g), k \rangle v^g &= -\lambda \int_M (\text{Tr } k) v^g \\ &= \int_M \left[-\lambda |h|^2 + \frac{\lambda}{2} (\text{Tr } h)^2 \right] v^g. \end{aligned} \tag{3.58}$$

We compute

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\partial}{\partial t} E_F(g_t) \Big|_{t=0} &= \frac{\partial F'(S_t)}{\partial t} \Big|_{t=0} \text{Ric} + F'(S) \frac{\partial \text{Ric}_t}{\partial t} \Big|_{t=0} \\ &\quad - \frac{\partial \text{Hess}_t F'(S_t)}{\partial t} \Big|_{t=0} - \frac{\partial \Delta_t F'(S_t)}{\partial t} \Big|_{t=0} g \\ &\quad - \Delta F'(S) h - \frac{1}{2} \frac{\partial F(S_t)}{\partial t} \Big|_{t=0} g - \frac{1}{2} F(S) h, \end{aligned} \tag{3.59}$$

note that, from the Lemma 2.1, we have

$$\frac{\partial F(S_t)}{\partial t} \Big|_{t=0} = F'(S) [\Delta(\text{Tr } h) + \delta(\delta h) - \langle \text{Ric}, h \rangle], \tag{3.60}$$

$$\frac{\partial F'(S_t)}{\partial t} \Big|_{t=0} = F''(S) [\Delta(\text{Tr } h) + \delta(\delta h) - \langle \text{Ric}, h \rangle], \tag{3.61}$$

by Lemma 3.1, and the definition of Lichnerowicz Laplacian, we get

$$\begin{aligned}
\left. \frac{\partial \text{Ric}_t}{\partial t} \right|_{t=0} &= \frac{1}{2} \Delta_L h - \delta^*(\delta h) - \frac{1}{2} \text{Hess}(\text{Tr } h) \\
&= \frac{1}{2} \nabla^* \nabla h - \overset{\circ}{R}h + \frac{1}{2} \text{Ric} \circ h + \frac{1}{2} h \circ \text{Ric} \\
&\quad - \delta^*(\delta h) - \frac{1}{2} \text{Hess}(\text{Tr } h),
\end{aligned} \tag{3.62}$$

from equations (3.59), (3.60), (3.61), (3.62), and the Lemma 3.2, we have

$$\begin{aligned}
\left. \frac{\partial}{\partial t} E_F(g_t) \right|_{t=0} &= f \text{Ric} + F'(S) \left[\frac{1}{2} \nabla^* \nabla h - \overset{\circ}{R}h + \frac{1}{2} \text{Ric} \circ h + \frac{1}{2} h \circ \text{Ric} \right. \\
&\quad \left. - \delta^*(\delta h) - \frac{1}{2} \text{Hess}(\text{Tr } h) \right] - \text{Hess } f + (\nabla \cdot h)(\cdot, \text{grad } F'(S))^\sigma \\
&\quad - \frac{1}{2} \nabla_{\text{grad } F'(S)} h - (\Delta f)g + \langle \delta h + \frac{1}{2} d(\text{Tr } h), dF'(S) \rangle g \\
&\quad - \langle \text{Hess } F'(S), h \rangle g - (\Delta F'(S))h - \frac{F'(S)}{2} [\Delta(\text{Tr } h) \\
&\quad + \delta(\delta h) - \langle \text{Ric}, h \rangle] g - \frac{1}{2} F(S)h,
\end{aligned} \tag{3.63}$$

where $f = F''(S) [\Delta(\text{Tr } h) + \delta(\delta h) - \langle \text{Ric}, h \rangle]$.

Note that, from the definitions of the composition (2.10) and the F -Einstein tensor (2.16), and the condition $E_F(g) = \lambda g$, we get

$$\begin{aligned}
\frac{F'(S)}{2} (\text{Ric} \circ h + h \circ \text{Ric}) &= [\lambda + \Delta F'(S) + \frac{1}{2} F(S)] h \\
&\quad + h(\nabla \cdot \text{grad } F'(S), \cdot)^\sigma,
\end{aligned} \tag{3.64}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
\frac{F'(S)}{2} \langle \text{Ric}, h \rangle g &= \frac{1}{2} [\lambda + \Delta F'(S) + \frac{1}{2} F(S)] (\text{Tr } h) g \\
&\quad + \frac{1}{2} \langle \text{Hess } F'(S), h \rangle g.
\end{aligned} \tag{3.65}$$

From equations (3.52), (3.53), (3.54), (3.58), (3.63), (3.64) and (3.65), we have

$$\begin{aligned}
\left. \frac{d^2}{dt^2} \mathcal{E}_F(g_t) \right|_{t=0} &= \int_M \left\langle -f \text{Ric} - \frac{F'(S)}{2} \nabla^* \nabla h + F'(S) \overset{\circ}{R}h \right. \\
&\quad \left. - h(\nabla \cdot \text{grad } F'(S), \cdot)^\sigma + F'(S) \delta^*(\delta h) \right. \\
&\quad \left. + \frac{1}{2} F'(S) \text{Hess}(\text{Tr } h) + \text{Hess } f - (\nabla \cdot h)(\cdot, \text{grad } F'(S))^\sigma \right. \\
&\quad \left. + \frac{1}{2} \nabla_{\text{grad } F'(S)} h + (\Delta f)g - \langle \delta h + \frac{1}{2} d(\text{Tr } h), dF'(S) \rangle g \right. \\
&\quad \left. + \frac{F'(S)}{2} [\Delta(\text{Tr } h) + \delta(\delta h)]g - \frac{1}{2} [\lambda + \Delta F'(S) \right. \\
&\quad \left. + \frac{1}{2} F(S)] (\text{Tr } h)g + \frac{1}{2} \langle \text{Hess } F'(S), h \rangle g, h \right\rangle v^g,
\end{aligned} \tag{3.66}$$

the Theorem follows from equation (3.66). \square

Remark 3.1. *If $F(s) = s$, for all $s \in \mathbb{R}$. Note that, the condition $E_F(g) = \lambda g$ is equivalent to $\text{Ric} = [\lambda + \frac{S}{2}]g$. That is, g is Einstein Riemannian metric with constant $\mu = \lambda + \frac{S}{2}$. In*

this case, we have

$$\begin{aligned} T_0(h) &= -\frac{1}{2}\nabla^*\nabla h + \overset{\circ}{R}h + \delta^*(\delta h) + \frac{1}{2}\text{Hess}(\text{Tr } h) \\ &\quad + \frac{1}{2}[\Delta(\text{Tr } h) + \delta(\delta h)]g - \frac{\mu}{2}(\text{Tr } h)g, \end{aligned}$$

and $T_1(h) = 0$. From the formula

$$(\text{Tr } h)\delta(\delta h) = \delta((\text{Tr } h)\delta h) + \delta(h(\cdot, \text{grad}(\text{Tr } h))) + \langle \text{Hess}(\text{Tr } h), h \rangle,$$

and the divergence theorem (see [2]), the second variation of $\mathcal{E}_F|_{\mathcal{M}_c}$ at g in the direction of h is given by (see [4], [9])

$$\begin{aligned} \left. \frac{d^2}{dt^2} \mathcal{E}_F(g_t) \right|_{t=0} &= \int_M \left\langle -\frac{1}{2}\nabla^*\nabla h + \overset{\circ}{R}h + \delta^*(\delta h) \right. \\ &\quad \left. + \frac{1}{2}\Delta(\text{Tr } h)g + \delta(\delta h)g - \frac{\mu}{2}(\text{Tr } h)g, h \right\rangle v^g. \end{aligned}$$

Definition 3.1. A Riemannian manifold (M, g) is said to be F -Einstein if $E_F(g) = \lambda g$ for some constant λ , where $F : \mathbb{R} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ is a non-constant smooth function. We call λ the F -Einstein constant of g . We say that a closed orientable F -Einstein manifold is stable (resp. strictly stable) if for any $h \in TT = \text{Tr}^{-1}(0) \cap \delta^{-1}(0)$ (such tensors are called transverse traceless or TT -tensors)

$$\mathcal{E}_F''(h) = \int_M \langle \widehat{T}_0(h) + \widehat{T}_1(h), h \rangle v^g \leq 0 \quad (\text{resp. } < 0),$$

where $\widehat{T}_0, \widehat{T}_1$ are the restrictions of T_0, T_1 to TT respectively, given by

$$\widehat{T}_0(h) = -\frac{F'(S)}{2}[\nabla^*\nabla h - 2\overset{\circ}{R}h],$$

$$\widehat{T}_1(h) = -\widehat{f}\text{Ric} + \frac{1}{2}\nabla_{\text{grad } F'(S)}h,$$

and $\widehat{f} = f|_{TT} = -F''(S)\langle \text{Ric}, h \rangle$.

Remark 3.2.

- In the Definition 3.1, $\text{Tr}^{-1}(0)$ (resp. $\delta^{-1}(0)$) denotes the space of symmetric $(0, 2)$ -tensor fields, whose trace (resp. divergence) vanishes on (M, g) .
- By using $\delta h = 0$ and symmetry of h , we obtain the following formulas

$$\begin{aligned} \langle \text{Hess } \widehat{f}, h \rangle &= -\delta[h(\text{grad } \widehat{f}, \cdot)]; \\ -\langle h(\nabla \cdot \text{grad } F'(S), \cdot)^\sigma, h \rangle - \langle (\nabla \cdot h)(\cdot, \text{grad } F'(S))^\sigma, h \rangle \\ &= \delta[(h \circ h)(\text{grad } F'(S), \cdot)]. \end{aligned}$$

This explains the disappearance of these terms in $\langle \widehat{T}_1(h), h \rangle$ after integration over M .

- The Definition 3.1, is a natural generalization of stable Einstein manifold (see [4, 9, 11, 12]).
- We call the operator $\Delta_E^F(h) = -2(\widehat{T}_0(h) + \widehat{T}_1(h))$ the F -Einstein operator. Thus, an F -Einstein manifold (M, g) is stable, if the F -Einstein operator is nonnegative on TT -tensors, and strictly stable if it is positive on TT -tensors. If $F(s) = s$ for all

$s \in \mathbb{R}$, then the F -Einstein operator reduces to the usual Einstein operator $\Delta_E(h) = \nabla^* \nabla h - 2\overset{\circ}{R}h$.

Theorem 3.2. *Let $F \in C^\infty(\mathbb{R})$. We assume that $F'(s) \geq 0$ (resp. $F'(s) > 0$) for all $s \in \mathbb{R}$. Then, any Einstein manifold of negative sectional curvature is stable (resp. strictly stable) F -Einstein manifold.*

Proof. Let (M, g) be an Einstein manifold with Einstein constant μ , i.e., $\text{Ric} = \mu g$. Thus, (M, g) is F -Einstein manifold with F -Einstein constant $\lambda = \mu F'(S) - \frac{1}{2}F(S)$. Moreover, $\hat{f} = 0$ and the F -Einstein operator becomes

$$\Delta_E^F(h) = F'(S)[\nabla^* \nabla h - 2\overset{\circ}{R}h].$$

Hence, if $F'(S) \geq 0$ (resp. $F'(S) > 0$) and the sectional curvature of (M, g) is negative, then (M, g) is stable (resp. strictly stable) F -Einstein manifold (see [9, 10]). \square

Remark 3.3. *Let (M, g) be an F -Einstein manifold with F -Einstein constant λ . We assume that (M, g) has constant scalar curvature. If $F'(S) > 0$, according to (2.16), the Riemannian manifold (M, g) is Einstein with Einstein constant $\mu = F'(S)^{-1}(\lambda + \frac{1}{2}F(S))$. Moreover, if the sectional curvature of (M, g) is negative, then (M, g) is strictly stable. Here, if the manifold M is even-dimensional, by using (2.34) with $E_F(g) = \lambda g$, we can consider the smooth function $F(s) = -2\lambda + c s^{n/2}$ for some $c \in \mathbb{R}$.*

Theorem 3.3. *Let $F \in C^\infty(\mathbb{R})$ and (M, g) be a closed orientable F -Einstein manifold of constant sectional curvature $c > 0$. We assume that $F'(s) \geq 0$ and $F''(s) \leq 0$ for all $s \in \mathbb{R}$. Then, (M, g) is stable. Moreover, if $F'(s) > 0$ for all $s \in \mathbb{R}$, then (M, g) is strictly stable.*

Proof. A straightforward calculation shows that if $h \in TT$,

$$\begin{aligned} -\frac{F'(S)}{2} \langle \nabla^* \nabla h, h \rangle &= -\frac{1}{2} \delta [F'(S) \langle \nabla \cdot h, h \rangle] - \frac{1}{2} \langle \nabla_{\text{grad } F'(S)} h, h \rangle \\ &\quad - \frac{F'(S)}{2} \text{Tr} \langle \nabla \cdot h, \nabla \cdot h \rangle. \end{aligned} \quad (3.67)$$

By using $\text{Tr } h = 0$, we find that

$$F'(S) \langle \overset{\circ}{R}h, h \rangle = -c F'(S) |h|^2. \quad (3.68)$$

From equations (3.67) and (3.69), we conclude that

$$\begin{aligned} \mathcal{E}_F''(h) &= \int_M \left[-\frac{1}{2} F'(S) \text{Tr} \langle \nabla \cdot h, \nabla \cdot h \rangle - c F'(S) |h|^2 \right. \\ &\quad \left. + F''(S) \langle \text{Ric}, h \rangle^2 \right] v^g. \end{aligned} \quad (3.69)$$

Theorem 3.3 follows from equation (3.69), the assumptions $F' \geq 0$, $F'' \leq 0$, and $c > 0$. \square

Corollary 3.1. *The n -dimensional unit sphere \mathbb{S}^n is a strictly stable F -Einstein manifold for all $F \in C^\infty(\mathbb{R})$ such that $F' > 0$ and $F'' \leq 0$.*

Acknowledgments. The author would like to thank the editor and the reviewers for their useful remarks and suggestions.

REFERENCES

- [1] Andersson, L., & Moncrief, V. (2011). Einstein spaces as attractors for the Einstein flow. *Journal of Differential Geometry*, 89(1), 1–47.
- [2] Baird, P., & Wood, J. C. (2003). *Harmonic morphisms between Riemannian manifolds*. Clarendon Press.
- [3] Berger, M. (1970). Quelques formules de variation pour une structure riemannienne. *Annales Scientifiques de l'École Normale Supérieure*, 4(3), 285–294.
- [4] Besse, A. L. (1987). *Einstein manifolds*. Springer-Verlag.
- [5] Calabi, E. (1982). Extremal Kähler metrics. *Annals of Mathematics Studies*, 102, 259–290.
- [6] Calabi, E. (1985). Extremal Kähler metrics II. In *Differential geometry and complex analysis* (pp. 95–114). Springer.
- [7] De Felice, A., & Tsujikawa, S. (2010). $f(R)$ theories. *arXiv*. arXiv:1002.4928v2 [gr-qc].
- [8] Hilbert, D. (1915). Die Grundlagen der Physik. *Nachrichten von der Gesellschaft der Wissenschaften zu Göttingen*, 395–407.
- [9] Kröncke, K. (2013). *Stability of Einstein manifolds* [Doctoral dissertation, University of Potsdam].
- [10] Koiso, N. (1978). Nondeformability of Einstein metrics. *Osaka Journal of Mathematics*, 15, 419–433.
- [11] Koiso, N. (1979). On the second derivative of the total scalar curvature. *Osaka Journal of Mathematics*, 16, 413–421.
- [12] Koiso, N. (1980). Rigidity and stability of Einstein metrics: The case of compact symmetric spaces. *Osaka Journal of Mathematics*, 17, 51–73.
- [13] Koiso, N. (1982). Rigidity and infinitesimal deformability of Einstein metrics. *Osaka Journal of Mathematics*, 19, 643–668.
- [14] Müller, R. (2006). *Differential Harnack inequalities and the Ricci flow*. European Mathematical Society.
- [15] O'Neill, B. (1983). *Semi-Riemannian geometry*. Academic Press.
- [16] Schoen, R. M. (1989). Variational theory for the total scalar curvature functional for Riemannian metrics and related topics. In *Topics in calculus of variations: Lectures given at the 2nd Session of the Centro Internazionale Matematico Estivo (C.I.M.E.)* (Lecture Notes in Mathematics, Vol. 1365, pp. 120–154). Springer.
- [17] Sotiriou, T. P., & Faraoni, V. (2010). $f(R)$ theories of gravity. *arXiv*. arXiv:0805.1726v4 [gr-qc].
- [18] Topping, P. (2006). *Lectures on the Ricci flow* (London Mathematical Society Lecture Note Series, Vol. 325). Cambridge University Press.

(A. Mohammed Cherif) UNIVERSITY MUSTAPHA STAMBOULI MASCARA, FACULTY OF EXACT SCIENCES, MASCARA 29000, ALGERIA.